



CITY OF CARSON

Legislation Text

File #: 2017-433, Version: 1

Report to Mayor and City Council

Tuesday, June 06, 2017

Discussion

SUBJECT:

CONSULTING SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH DYETT & BHATIA TO PREPARE CITY'S COMPREHENSIVE GENERAL PLAN UPDATE FOR A NOT-TO-EXCEED AMOUNT OF \$1,110,194 (CITY COUNCIL)

I. SUMMARY

On April 18, 2017, the City Council continued this item and requested staff to provide additional information regarding locations of the firms interviewed, contract amounts, and their rankings. In addition, the City Council requested the management staff to review the proposals to ensure the best consultant team is selected. Staff has provided the requested additional information in the staff report and has reviewed the proposals from the consultants. Staff's original recommendation to award the contract to Dyett & Bhatia remains the same.

The department heads related to the General Plan were asked to review the proposals and draw their own conclusions about the recommendations. The Community Development Director reviewed all of the materials related to the selection and looked at all of the proposals. All of the proposals had merit in different ways, and there was considerable overlap in the subcontractors such as the traffic engineers and the economic consultants. Dyett & Bhatia, however, appeared to do the most "homework" about Carson and presented the proposal that was most tailored to Carson's unique character, drawing on its experience working in industrial communities, and proposing a Sustainability & Health Element. Further, offering a principal of the firm, somebody with decades of experience in crafting General Plans in California, was another positive factor in their favor.

II. RECOMMENDATION

AWARD a consulting services contract in the amount of \$1,110,194 to Dyett & Bhatia.

III. ALTERNATIVES

NONE

IV. BACKGROUND

In 2018 the City will celebrate its 50th anniversary as an incorporated City. To address the City's ambitions for the next several decades, the City will need to undertake a comprehensive update of its General Plan. The community engagement process as part of the General Plan Update will enable the community to evaluate opportunities and develop a community-wide vision for the City. The result of this effort will be a blueprint for the future of Carson - an action-oriented General Plan along with an implementation plan for achieving those goals. After a thorough Request for Proposals process, staff is recommending the firm of Dyett & Bhatia to assist the City with this project and recommends approval of a consulting services contract.

State Law requires each California local jurisdiction to adopt a General Plan "for the physical development of the City." A General Plan is a planning document containing the goals, objectives and policies to guide a jurisdiction's physical growth, transformation and/or preservation for a period of approximately 20 years. It is comprised of text, diagrams and maps to effectively communicate how the General Plan is to be implemented.

Carson's current General Plan was adopted in 2004. Carson and its population and businesses are changing and growing. The City has now reached an appropriate point in time to revisit the guiding vision and policies in Carson's General Plan, and initiate a comprehensive General Plan Update program. In the period since the 2004 adoption, Carson has grown and matured and now faces new challenges and opportunities. For example, the once abstract principles of environmental justice and sustainability are now an accepted part of local policymaking.

An updated General Plan will enable Carson to address the many land use, transportation, and environmental challenges currently facing the City in the years ahead, assist the City in setting a vision, and identify the steps necessary to realize the vision. It will also assist the local government and the community in prioritizing their goals, and to assist the City in managing and supporting this change and growth by providing diversified housing, business, and employment opportunities. At the same time, the City's economic viability may be at risk unless it formulates new strategies to promote fiscally sound practices. A comprehensive update to the General Plan would enable the City to proactively guide the City through another period of growth and change.

CONSULTANT SELECTION PROCESS

On December 21, 2016, the City sent an RFP to seven highly qualified planning firms, inviting them to submit proposals to prepare the Comprehensive General Plan Update. The City also placed an announcement on the American Planning Association national website. In response, the City received proposals from six firms: DeNovo Planning Group; Civic Solutions; Dyett & Bhatia (D&B); Michael Baker, International; PlaceWorks; and Raimi & Associates. A staff panel reviewed and ranked all six proposals and selected the three highest scoring proposals to be interviewed.

Rank	Lead Firm	Subconsultant Firms	Proposal Amount
1	Dyett & Bhatia, San Francisco	• HR&A • Arellano Associates • Fehr & Peers • ESA	\$896,668

2	Raimi & Associates, Los Angeles	• Lisa Wise Consulting • Sargent Town Planning • Fehr & Peers • Rincon	\$998,910
3	PlaceWorks, Los Angeles	• BAE Urban Economics • Studio One Eleven • Fehr & Peers • Tetra Tech • SWCA	\$1,028,828
4	DeNovo Planning Group, Orange	• BAE Urban Economics • Fehr & Peers • Fuscoe Engineering • SWCA • JC Brennan	\$1,008,325
5	Michael Baker, Irvine	• Stanley Hoffman Associates • Fehr and Peers • Roux Associates • BCR Consulting	\$995,720
6	Civic Solutions, San Juan Capistrano	• RSG • LSA • Avance Public Outreach • Evri GIS Consulting	\$986,528

On February 27, 2017 and March 3, 2017, a staff panel interviewed the top three ranked firms. After the interviews staff ranked D&B first, followed by Raimi and Associates, and PlaceWorks. All firms submitted outstanding proposals; however, Dyett & Bhatia (D&B) delivered superior responses in the interview that demonstrated their qualifications were fit to address Carson's issues such as:

- In-depth experience working in communities with industrial and multifamily development issues (Emeryville, South San Francisco, San Pablo, San Diego);
- Well-reasoned solutions that could apply to the development issues facing Carson;
- Strong command of the link between the General Plan and Zoning Ordinance to incentivize development;
- Strong understanding of planning and public health and sustainability;
- Strong commend of fiscal impacts of planning and development;
- Compelling public outreach strategy that utilizes workshops, pop-ups, and collaboration with stakeholders led by a CSUDH graduate.

Following the interviews, staff contacted references from the cities of San Diego, Redlands and Richmond. The references have utilized D&B for a General Plan and Zoning Ordinance Update. All references provided positive reviews of the firm's work quality, adherence to budget, timeliness, communication, experience, and expertise.

SUMMARY OF DYETT & BHATIA PROPOSAL

Project Approach - D&B has a thorough understanding of the City's objectives for the General Plan Update and presented an approach to address the following key planning issues:

- Working with the community and decision makers to articulate a vision for the City, and translate this vision into a viable implementation program;
- Fostering balanced land use development;
- Fostering complete streets, improving multimodal mobility, and completing transportation facility improvements;
- Enhancing the built environment and place-making to foster quality of life and

community health;

- Enhancing the City fiscally through economic development and other means;
- Adapting to a diverse and changing population;
- Fostering sustainable development, reducing greenhouse gas emissions, and promoting environmental justice.

Schedule - The General Plan and the Zoning Code update is expected to be completed in Fall of 2019.

Firm Credentials - Within the past five years, D&B has won 14 awards from the American Planning Association. The firm has prepared general plans for more than 60 cities and counties in California, including more than 20 communities in the last 10 years.

Project Approach - The final product will be a contemporary General Plan that will inform and guide decision makers, stakeholders, and staff with the challenges the community and the City will face in the next two decades. D&B describes their philosophy as follows:

At Dyett & Bhatia, we believe that plan-making is a collaborative process that involves decision-makers, the public, and staff. We use the best tools available for research and analysis and are adept at synthesizing a wide range of information into choices that are logical and understandable. Through our work we seek to give form to community aspirations and foster places that are vital, livable, and reflect environmental stewardship. Our work is responsive to physical and natural settings, economic realities, and community needs. We always tailor our work programs to each community's needs; we don't have "cookie-cutter" solutions, nor are we missionaries, advocating a particular community design philosophy. We believe that planning decisions must express a community's personality and its perception of the public interest.

Growth and change can affect a community's quality of life and a government's ability to serve its citizens. To lessen these impacts, local officials-and the residents and businesses they serve-must be informed of the consequences of land use alternatives by a systematic assessment of the impacts of future development on capital facilities, public services, and the natural environment. How much and where to grow is, ultimately, a policy issue that must be decided by elected officials with informed public participation. Planners can help by offering creative choices that respond to local issues and concerns and by outlining the economic, fiscal, and environmental trade-offs. The Carson General Plan should serve as the City's constitution. To be effective, this constitution should:

- *Be clear, concise, easy to use, and internally consistent;*
- *Address a comprehensive range of subject matter, such as land use, transportation, natural resource management, economic development and community design; and*
- *Provide clear direction for evaluating development proposals and for planning capital improvements.*

Project Manager - Rajeev Bhatia, AICP, ASLA will serve as the project manager. Mr. Bhatia is a partner/principal with the firm and led the presentation during the interview process. As a partner with the firm, Mr. Bhatia will be able to make immediate decisions when required to do without delays.

Project Team - D&B will serve as the project lead and will be assisted by the following firms:

- **Environmental Science Associates (ESA)** will perform technical analysis for the

General Plan Update and assistance with CEQA compliance through the preparation of EIR sections as it pertains to air quality, biological resources, cultural resources, greenhouses gases (GHG), noise, hazards and hydrology. ESA will also be responsible for performing noise measurements as a means of developing existing noise contours, peer review of associated General Plan elements, and assist in responding to comments associated with these sections.

- **Fehr & Peers** will prepare the transportation and mobility analyses for the Circulation Element and the EIR. They will consider existing conditions, analyze alternatives, develop the final recommended transportation network for all modes, and prepare the Circulation Element with D&B.
- **HR&A Advisors** HR&A will provide market and economic analysis to support assessment of land use alternatives and development of the General Plan; prepare the fiscal impact analysis; and prepare the financial feasibility analysis of site testing scenarios.
- **Arellano Associates** Arellano Associates will assist D&B with community outreach and facilitation. They will help design and lead workshops, promote the project at community events, attend additional meetings with neighborhood groups, and create interactive elements for the website to facilitate enhanced online engagement.

References - D&B and their project team has excellent references from previous clients providing similar services (cities of San Diego, South San Francisco, Diamond Bar, and Emeryville).

Budget - Once D&B was selected as the top firm, staff negotiated some revisions to the scope and budget. The most significant additions were more robust fiscal and market analysis and a comprehensive update of the zoning code. With these revisions, D&B's project budget is \$1,110,194, as summarized in the table below:

DYETT & BHATIA PROJECT BUDGET

Phase I: Project Initiation, Visioning, and Issue Identification	
1. Project Initiation	\$34,876
2. Visioning and Issue Identification	\$73,331
3. Existing Conditions, Trends, and Oppor	\$147,926
Phase II: Options and Strategies	
4. Alternatives	\$144,067
5. Preferred Plan and Key Goals	\$76,120
Phase III: Draft and Final Documents	
6. Draft General Plan	\$155,132
7. Draft and Final EIR	\$203,495
8. Zoning Code Update	\$249,500
9. General Plan Hearings and Adoption	\$25,747

TOTAL	\$1,110,194
--------------	--------------------

V. FISCAL IMPACT

The City Council adopted the General Plan and Zoning Code Update fee as part of the FY 2016/2017 budget. This fee is assessed through building permits and is expected to pay for the entire cost of the update. The fee has collected to date approximately \$145,000 and staff estimates that the fee will collect \$302,000 during the next fiscal year. The proposed three-year Consulting Services Agreement authorizes the Consultant to submit invoices to the City for a not-to-exceed amount of \$1,110,194 as tasks are completed. It is anticipated over the next four years that the General Plan and Zone Code Update fee will reimburse the General Fund reserve account for the entire costs of this contract and associated staffing costs.

VI. EXHIBITS

1. Consulting Services Agreement Dated April 18, 2017 (p. 7-69)
2. Request for Proposals (p. 70-78)
3. Proposal from Dyett & Bhatia (p. 79-202)

Prepared by: John Raymond, Community Development Director