



## **CITY OF CARSON**

### **MINUTES CARSON CITY COUNCIL/ SUCCESSOR AGENCY/HOUSING AUTHORITY REGULAR MEETING JUNE 1, 2021 5:00 P.M.**

#### **CALL TO ORDER:**

The meeting was called to order at 5:01 P.M. by Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Lula Davis-Holmes via Zoom Teleconference.

#### **ROLL CALL:**

Deputy City Clerk/Deputy Agency Secretary/Deputy Authority Secretary Joy Simarago noted the roll:

#### **Council Members/Agency Members/Authority Board Members Present via Zoom Teleconference:**

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Lula Davis-Holmes, Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Jim Dear, Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Jawane Hilton, and Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Cedric Hicks

#### **Also Present via Zoom Teleconference:**

John W. Carroll, Sr., Chief Deputy City Clerk/Chief Deputy Agency Secretary/Chief Deputy Authority Secretary; Monica Cooper, City/Agency/Authority Treasurer; Sharon Landers, City Manager; Sunny Soltani, City/Agency/Authority Attorney; Benjamin Jones, Assistant City/Agency/Authority Attorney; David Roberts, Assistant City Manager; John Raymond, Assistant City Manager; Saied Naaseh, Director of Community Development; Faye Moseley, Director of Human Resources and Risk Management; Tarik Rahmani, Director of Finance; Robert Lennox, Director of Community Services; and Eliza Jane Whitman, Director of Public Works

#### **FLAG SALUTE:**

Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear led the Pledge of Allegiance.

**INVOCATION:**

**Item No. 1. 2021-426 PASTOR BYRON SMITH, LIFTING THE VEIL MINISTRIES**

Pastor Byron Smith gave the invocation.

**CLOSED SESSION (Items 2-3)**

**REPORT ON ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON CLOSED SESSION ITEMS (CITY CLERK) -**  
None

**ANNOUNCEMENT OF CLOSED SESSION ITEMS (CITY ATTORNEY)**  
City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani announced the Closed Session items.

**RECESS INTO CLOSED SESSION**  
The meeting was recessed at 5:06 P.M. by Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes to Closed Session.

**RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION**  
The meeting was reconvened at 6:10 P.M. by Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes with all members previously noted present.

**REPORT ON CLOSED SESSION ACTIONS (CITY ATTORNEY)**  
City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani provided the Closed Session report as follows:

**Item No. 2. 2021-308 CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - ANTICIPATED LITIGATION (CITY COUNCIL)**

Recommendation: A closed session will be held, pursuant to Government Code Section 54956.9 (d)(2) or (d)(3) & (e)(1), because there is a significant exposure to litigation in two cases.

ACTION: No reportable action was taken in one case. The other case to be taken up later in the meeting.

At 11:39 P.M., City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani reported no reportable action was taken.

**Item No. 3. 2021-342 CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - ANTICIPATED LITIGATION (CITY COUNCIL)**

Recommendation: A closed session will be held, pursuant to Government Code Section 54956.9 (d)(4) because the City is considering whether to initiate litigation in one case.

ACTION: This item will be taken up later in the meeting.

At 11:39 P.M., City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani reported no reportable action was taken.

## **INTRODUCTIONS (MAYOR)**

### **Item No. 4. 2021-401 REPORT FROM CAPTAIN JONES OF CARSON SHERIFF'S STATION**

Captain Jones reported/announced the following:

- Thanked and honored all those whose families lost their lives or paid the ultimate sacrifice for us to live in this great country
- Homeless Team enforcing the City's recreational vehicle (RV) ordinance
- Do not use your cell phone while driving and drive slowly
- Met with LAUSD administrators and Carnegie Middle School staff regarding summer school sessions, activities, and traffic control plan
- Reminded everyone to be respectful to park staff
- Parks Team providing safety at all city parks
- Coffee with the Station Town Hall Meeting held two weeks ago
- Shared flyer and video clip regarding Fireworks Safety and Penalties
- Shooting incident, suspects captured, and investigation ongoing

## **PRESENTATIONS**

### **Item No. 5. 2021-086 PROCLAMATION DECLARING JUNE AS MEN'S HEALTH MONTH**

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks read and presented the proclamation. He introduced Dr. Onyeagocha who made presentation on behalf of Kaiser Hospital.

(Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes exited the meeting.)

### **Item No. 6. 2021-097 PROCLAMATION RECOGNIZING ANNIVERSARY PHILIPPINE INDEPENDENCE DAY (JUNE 12TH)**

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton read and presented proclamation. He introduced Fred Docdocil, representing Philippine Independence Day Foundation (PIDF), who offered comments.

(Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes reentered the meeting.)

**ORAL COMMUNICATIONS FOR MATTERS LISTED ON THE AGENDA (MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC) – None.**

## **APPROVAL OF MINUTES:**

### **Item No. 7. 2021-421 APPROVAL OF THE OCTOBER 20, 2020 CITY COUNCIL/SUCCESSOR AGENCY/HOUSING AUTHORITY REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**

Recommendation: Approve the minutes as listed.

ACTION: It was moved to approve staff recommendation on motion of Dear, seconded by Hilton and unanimously carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes, Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear, Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton, and Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks

Noes: None

Abstain: None

Absent: None

**CONSENT: (Items 8-15)**

It was moved to approve the Consent items on motion of Dear, seconded by Hicks and unanimously carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes, Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear, Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton, and Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks

Noes: None

Abstain: None

Absent: None

**Item No. 8. 2021-422 Resolution No. 21-067, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF CARSON RATIFYING CLAIMS AND DEMANDS IN THE AMOUNT OF \$2,765,518.11, DEMAND CHECK NUMBERS 157829 THROUGH 158061**

ACTION: Item No. 8 was approved on Consent.

**Item No. 9. 2021-423 Resolution No. 21-05-CSA, A RESOLUTION OF THE CARSON SUCCESSOR AGENCY RATIFYING CLAIMS AND DEMANDS IN THE AMOUNT OF \$7,494.80, DEMAND CHECK NUMBERS SA-001830 THROUGH SA-001831**

ACTION: Item No. 9 was approved on Consent.

**Item No. 10. 2021-424 Resolution No. 21-05-CHA, A RESOLUTION OF THE CARSON HOUSING AUTHORITY RATIFYING CLAIMS AND DEMANDS IN THE AMOUNT OF \$20,737.56, DEMAND CHECK NUMBERS HA-001854 through HA-001858**

ACTION: Item No. 10 was approved on Consent.

**Item No. 11. 2021-397      CONSIDER A PROFESSIONAL SERVICES AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE CITY OF CARSON AND EVAN BROOKS ASSOCIATES, INC. FOR PROFESSIONAL GRANT WRITING SERVICES (CITY COUNCIL)**

Recommendation:      1. APPROVE the proposed contract services agreement with Evan Brooks Associates, Inc. for professional grant writing services for a three-year term, for a not-to-exceed contract sum of \$29,904 for the first year, and \$31,008 for the second and third years, for a total contract sum of \$91,920 for the three-year term (Exhibit No. 1 "the Agreement"); and  
2. AUTHORIZE the Mayor to execute the Agreement following approval as to form by the City Attorney.

ACTION:      Item No. 11 was approved on Consent.

**Item No. 12. 2021-395      CONSIDER A PUBLIC WORKS AGREEMENT WITH VERNE'S PLUMBING, INC. FOR THE TESTING, REPAIR AND REPLACEMENT OF CITY-OWNED BACKFLOW PREVENTION DEVICES (CITY COUNCIL)**

Recommendation:      TAKE the following actions:  
1. APPROVE a Public Works Agreement with Verne's Plumbing, Inc., to provide backflow device repair and testing services to the City in an amount not-to-exceed \$50,000 for an initial three-year term, with City options to extend the term for up to two additional one-year periods thereafter at compensation not to exceed \$16,667 per one-year option period (Exhibit No. 1).  
2. AUTHORIZE Mayor to execute the Agreement following approval as to form by the City Attorney.

ACTION:      Item No. 12 was approved on Consent.

**Item No. 13. 2021-418      CONSIDER RESOLUTION NO. 21-068 APPROVING AND AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO EXECUTE A RIGHT OF WAY CONTRACT AGREEMENT BY AND BETWEEN THE CITY OF CARSON AND THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION FOR TEMPORARY USE OF A PORTION OF 2403 E. 223RD STREET FOR TEMPORARY STORAGE OF EQUIPMENT AND CONSTRUCTION EASEMENT ACCESS TO RETROFIT THE ADJACENT DOLORES YARD OVERHEAD BRIDGE PROJECT (APN: 7315-012-900) (CITY COUNCIL)**

Recommendation:      TAKE the following actions:  
1. WAIVE further reading and ADOPT Resolution No. 21-068, "A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF CARSON, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING AND AUTHORIZING THE

CITY MANAGER TO ENTER INTO RIGHT OF WAY CONTRACT AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE CITY OF CARSON AND THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION FOR STORAGE AND CONSTRUCTION EASEMENTS OF A PORTION OF REAL PROPERTY LOCATED AT 2403 E. 223RD STREET (APN 7315-012-900)"

2. AUTHORIZE the Mayor to execute the Resolution.

ACTION: Item No. 13 was approved on Consent.

**Item No. 14. 2021-425 CONSIDER THE ADOPTION OF RESOLUTION NO. 21-066 AUTHORIZING THE DESTRUCTION OF SPECIFIED RECORDS WITHIN THE CITY'S FINANCE DEPARTMENT (CITY COUNCIL)**

Recommendation: WAIVE further reading and ADOPT Resolution No. 21-066, "A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF CARSON, CALIFORNIA, AUTHORIZING THE DESTRUCTION OF SPECIFIED CITY RECORDS WITHIN THE CITY'S FINANCE DEPARTMENT."

ACTION: Item No. 14 was approved on Consent.

**Item No. 15. 2021-437 CONSIDER APPROVAL OF A PURCHASE ORDER AGREEMENT WITH QUINN CO. FOR THE PURCHASE OF A SKID STEER LOADER AND ASSOCIATED ATTACHMENTS IN THE AMOUNT OF \$121,375.28, AND APPROVING RESOLUTION NO. 21-069 AMENDING THE FISCAL YEAR 2020-21 BUDGET (CITY COUNCIL)**

Recommendation: TAKE the following actions:

1. WAIVE the formal bid process defined by the Carson Municipal Code, Section 2607, as allowed by Section 2605 (1) (ii).
2. AUTHORIZE the Purchasing Manager to utilize Cooperative Purchasing as allowed by Section 2611 (g) and issue a purchase order not to exceed \$121,375.28 for one new CAT 272D3 Skid Steer Loader and the associated equipment attachments required for ROW activities.
3. AWARD a purchase agreement to Quinn Co. in the amount of One Hundred and Twenty-One Thousand Three Hundred Seventy-Five and Twenty-eight Cents (\$121,375.28) for the purchase of a CAT 272D3 Skid Steer Loader and the associated equipment attachments required for ROW activities.
4. APPROVE Resolution No. 21-069, "A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY OF CARSON CITY COUNCIL AMENDING THE FISCAL YEAR 2020-21 BUDGET IN THE GENERAL FUND AND SPECIAL REVENUE"

ACTION: Item No. 15 was approved on Consent.

**SPECIAL ORDERS OF THE DAY: (Item 16)**

**Item No. 16. 2021-405 PUBLIC HEARING ON APPEAL OF CARSON PLANNING COMMISSION DECISION ADOPTING PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 21-2708, CONDITIONALLY APPROVING RELOCATION IMPACT REPORT NO. 04-19 FOR MITIGATION OF RELOCATION IMPACTS OF CLOSURE OF RANCHO DOMINGUEZ MOBILE ESTATES (CITY COUNCIL)**

Item No. 16 was heard after Item No. 21.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes declared the Public Hearing open and welcomed everyone to the meeting.

Deputy City Clerk/Deputy Agency Secretary/Deputy Authority Secretary Simarago gave the Public Hearing Notice report.

Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear stated he appealed the decision of the Planning Commission and in concurrence with his colleagues that they are here in the interest of the residents.

Director Naaseh gave a PowerPoint presentation on the Appeal of Planning Commission Decision Approving Rancho Dominguez Mobile Estates Relocation Impact Report RIR No. 4-19.

Director Naaseh asked Interpreter Diana to read slides in Spanish.

Director Naaseh continued with his presentation.

Director Naaseh concluded his presentation. He thanked the City Attorney's Office for assisting staff on this matter, especially Assistant City/Agency/Authority Attorney Benjamin Jones and announced the next steps of the Public Hearing process.

City Manager Landers also offered comments regarding the Public Hearing process.

Deputy City Clerk/Deputy Agency Secretary/Deputy Authority Secretary Simarago presented the following public comments that were submitted electronically:

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes stated Ana Zuniga and Susy Forbath for Thomas Casparian will be given ten minutes each to speak.

Debora Fore

Offered comments in response to the closure of Rancho Dominguez Mobile Estates

Dehsong Matheu

Offered comments on behalf of the residents of Rancho Dominguez Mobilehome Estates ("the

Park"), Neighborhood Legal Services of Los Angeles County requested that the City Council reschedule the hearing scheduled for June 1, 2021, regarding appeal of resolution 21-2708.

William Koons

Offered comments in opposition to the appraisals

Anonymous

Offered comments regarding the Rancho Dominguez Mobilehome Park closure, other mobilehome park closures, and their impacts in the community

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Homes inquired about anonymous comments. City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani stated the former City Clerk had a practice of not reading anonymous emails.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Homes directed that in the future anonymous emails will not be read.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani stated Ana Zuniga will be given the opportunity by the Mayor to speak for ten minutes as well as for the attorney representing the residents. If she plans to speak, it is not necessary to read her comments.

Ana Zuniga stated she plans to speak and requested to have her comments read. Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes stated she can read her comments when given time to speak.

Deputy City Clerk/Deputy Agency Secretary/Deputy Authority Secretary Simarago presented the following public comments that were submitted electronically:

Eduardo Almeda – Recorded Message Received May 31, 2021

Offered comments in opposition of the park closure and concerns of the elderly

Deputy City Clerk/Deputy Agency Secretary/Deputy Authority Secretary Simarago noted she received an email from Susy Forbath after the published time.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani stated Susy Forbath also represents the applicant and is with the Cozen law firm and suggested the Mayor apply the same to allow her to speak for ten minutes.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes requested the attorneys and applicants rebuttal to speak at this time.

Director Naaseh introduced Thomas Casparian.

Thomas Casparian, representing owners of Rancho Dominguez Mobile Estates (Cozen O'Connor)

Spoke about his letter regarding Rancho Dominguez Mobile Estates: Relocation Impact Report (RIR) No. 04-19



Director Naaseh introduced Ana Zuniga.

Ana Zuniga requested to read her letter at the end of the Public Hearing after the comments of all the residents are heard.

Director Naaseh introduced Dehsong Matheu.

Dehsong Matheu was not available when called upon.

Franco Carlos

Stated he would like a fair offer of what they deserve for their homes

Dina Contreras

Stated appraisals are not a fair estimate of the mobilehomes and park owners

Samuel Figueroa with Interpreter Diana

Offered comments in opposition to the appraisal

Miguel Delgado with Interpreter Diana

Offered comments in opposition to the appraisal

The following individuals spoke from the Carson Community Center:

Socorro Magana with Interpreter Diana

Asked for assistance

Gabriela Guerrero - Space #81, Rancho Dominguez Mobilehome Park, with Interpreter Diana

Inquired if correct and legal during COVID to continue with the closure of the park and asked for assistance

Jose Gonzalez with Interpreter Diana

Asked for fairness

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Dear inquired who informed speaker another 30 years and what was spent for improvements.

Director Naaseh stated the resident needs to provide proof of the amount paid.

Josefina Martinez - Space #24, Rancho Dominguez Mobilehome Park, with Interpreter Diana

Asked for assistance

Norma Torres with Interpreter Diana

Asked for support

Guadalupe Ovieda - Space #65, Rancho Dominguez Mobilehome Park, with Interpreter Diana

Asked for assistance for what is fair

Raul with Interpreter Diana

Stated to pay what is fair for their homes

Angelica Onyate - Space #77, Rancho Dominguez Mobilehome Park, with Interpreter Diana

Asked for assistance and fairness of price

Juan Martinez – Space #69, Rancho Dominguez Mobilehome Park, with Interpreter Diana

Asked for assistance

Speaker name not provided with Interpreter Diana

Asked for assistance

Sara Rodriguez with Interpreter Diana

Asked for assistance

Victor Manuel Camarena, Space #27, Rancho Dominguez Mobilehome Park

Asked for assistance

Jan Smith, Space #29, Rancho Dominguez Mobilehome Park

Inquired about the park closure process

Deborah Flor, Space # 55, Rancho Dominguez Mobilehome Park

Requested the City give a 10-year extension

Eduardo Anthony Almeda, Space #79, Rancho Dominguez Mobilehome Park

Opposed to the Rancho Dominguez Mobilehome Park closure and appraisal; asked for assistance

Martin Cervantes – President of Park Avalon Homeowners Association

Offered comments in support of Rancho Dominguez residents; going through the same process as the residents of Rancho Dominguez; requested assistance for the residents

Ana Barillas

Asked for fair price

Resident from Park Avalon

Opposed to Rancho Dominguez Mobilehome Park closure and requested assistance for the residents

Speaker with Interpreter Diana

Asked how long Thomas Casparian has been representing the park who mentioned he had been the attorney for a long time and clarification of extension

Ana Zuniga

Read her letter she emailed on June 1, 2021 on behalf of her clients, a group of mobile homeowners at Rancho Dominguez Mobile Estate Mobile Home Park, to appeal Resolution No. 21-2708, with any amendments, approved by the Planning Commission on April 27, 2021 regarding the Relocation Impact Report (RIR) No. 04-19 in relation to the closing of the Rancho

Dominguez Mobile Estates Mobile Home Park and reasons for the appeal.

Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear would like to have an opportunity to ask Ana Zuniga questions.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes stated questions can be done after close of the Public Hearing.

Dehsong Matheu, Attorney at Neighborhood Legal Services

Spoke about the new law AB 2782 and the city's current relocation plan

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes stated she will allow five minutes for rebuttal from the applicant.

Thomas Casparian

Stated he preferred to respond to any questions that the City Council may have. He submitted a letter to the City Council today that included the documents that he referred to in his presentation today and includes all of the letters that notified prospective residents of the pending park closure, the expiration of the variance. Also, the documents that were given to each one of the homeowners when they moved in that includes their initials on each one of the documents. As he set forth in his presentation before, he met with the city in all sorts of capacities with lawyers, without lawyers, the old Planning Director, the current Planning Director and have been trying to do something about this for years. He reiterated the point that the documentation is extensive.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes closed the Public Hearing at 9:22 P.M.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani presented key points and for Spanish Interpreter Diana to relay message. She noted process for residents to follow to redo their appraisal. She also noted the Planning Commission had resolution if residents have done upgrades that have not been properly appraised can be re-evaluated. She offered Executive Assistant Sylvia Rubio to take messages from Spanish speaking residents for assistance.

Interpreter Diana interpreted a resident's question: At the last meeting, the City Attorney Benjamin Jones stated that it was based on the closure of the park. They used the same prices of the homes and it was not updated. Why do we have to stay with them?

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani asked Interpreter Diana to explain to the residents that this is not a question/answer period and that she is providing information and responding to the arguments presented. She would be happy to have people call in later and happy to answer any questions after the Public Hearing since it is closed. Providing responses to the issues raised and to provide information for the residents at this time.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes requested staff to write additional questions and can address later in the meeting. She also requested Executive Assistant Sylvia Rubio's contact number.

Director Naaseh provided contact number (310) 952-1761 for Executive Assistant Sylvia Rubio and if she is not available to ask for an employee who also speaks Spanish such as Alvie Betancourt or Maria Gonzalez.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani noted another issue the residents raised if the renters are going to receive any benefits; renters are not going to receive any fair market value of coaches because they do not own their own coaches. However, the Planning Commission has included them in the relocation benefits that they would receive and the Planning Commission included them in the one year rent subsidies that they would receive. Renters receive some benefit as well and if the City Council were to take any of their measures to further mitigate the impacts of the park closure on the residents, the City Council can include those benefits for the renters as well.

Interpreter Diana confirmed she is interpreting City Attorney Soltani's comments verbatim.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani addressed Thomas Casparian's issues raised as follows:

- Bottom line is the City of Carson is not creating the park closure. The park closure is not the result of the city's planning, zoning actions or decisions; city has not started an enforcement action; there has not been any letters written to the park owner saying that the use has to stop right away. In fact, there were many letters exchanged with Mr. Casparian. They are all in the record for the City Council. There is a case law we cited in those letters that hold that amortization periods as applied to parks that will remain ongoing until a city compels the owner to close a park. The case law has held that it means that they get an extended amortization period. The 35-year period specified in the city's ordinance at that time is merely a safe harbor period during which the City Council would not pursue any actions to eliminate the non-conforming use of the park. After that any years that the park owner gets that's additional years. The City has not started a park closure or required this. In fact, in the correspondence as the residents pointed out the city did offer for the park owner to apply for a change of use if they wanted to if they did not want to close the park. They never pursued that and ignored that offer. She wanted the record to be clear this is a park owner-initiated park closure. There are plenty of correspondences on this issue.
- Issue raised by the residents about the Brabant appraisal. There are two issues under State law that the City Council has authority to consider. Under Assembly Bill (AB) 2782, residents are correct. The city has to require a fair market value in place appraisal of the coaches. What a willing knowing buyer is willing to pay to a willing knowing seller as if the park is going to continue and the park closure is not occurring. That is the issue some of the residents and the attorney representing Ana Zuniga are missing. This park presents a unique and unusual circumstance. AB 2782 does, in fact, clarify that is an in place value which Mr. Brabant has appraised and in his response letter which is Exhibit 10 to the staff report, he clarifies that under appraisal assumption they have to assume that the zoning laws are the zoning laws. Since the park is in a non-conforming use and willing knowing buyers have been paying a certain amount of money for it that is the fair market value analysis. Mr. Brabant explained in his letter between January 2009 and April 2020 there were a total of 32 sales in the park, 11 of those were purchased by residents so it was a purchase between residents and 21 by the park owner. Overall, he said there was a broad range in the 32 sales ranging from \$1,500 to one outlier at \$63,000 in 2009. He excluded

the outlier. The average of the sale was \$22,972. The 22 one park purchase ranged from 5,000 to 30,000 with an average of \$18,505. The resident purchases. The average of the other 10 sales was \$18,950 which was very close to the range of what the park owner had paid. His data he concludes supported that a willing knowing buyer was willing to pay in the neighborhood of \$18,505. Mr. Brabant's appraisal appraises the units on the average of \$28,000. It is higher than the sales that took place during that time period. He had his reasons for making the upward adjustments for the fair market values. The appraisal is AB 2782 compliant but thinks the residents are correct that the city absolutely has discretion under the new language in Government Code Section 65863.7 to impose any other conditions that the City Council fines are necessary to mitigate the negative impacts of the park closure. Specifically, subsection (k) of Government Code Section 65863.7 states, "This section establishes a minimum standard for local regulation of the conversion of a mobilehome park to another use, the closure of a mobilehome park, and cessation of use of the land as a mobilehome park and shall not prevent a local agency from enacting more stringent measures." The City Council definitely has further discretion to impose any conditions that the City Council believes are needed to adequately mitigate the impacts upon the ability of the displaced residents of the mobilehome park to find adequate housing in another mobilehome park. If the City Council finds an average of \$28,000 per coach is not sufficient and the one-year subsidy given by the Planning Commission's not sufficient, the City Council is free to look at other benefits to provide for the residents. Although the residents are correct in their concerns they are expressing about whether the fair market value will allow them to find adequate housing. The method used on the appraisal is not incorrect. It was a correct method but the City Council does have discretion during deliberations come up with other benefits if the City Council deems that to be the appropriate approach. The issue going back to Thomas Casparian's allegations that somehow they tried to seek a continuance or they wanted to get another variance at the time. I do not think any formal action was taken; it was dialogue between staff and attorneys but even if there was formal action by the city at that point if the park owner was unhappy with the city's decision, the park owner could have sued the city at that time or could have brought an action to try to address their claims at that time. A decade later they try to file a park closure application and say it is the city's fault. The city never commenced the park closure and never ordered the park to close.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani stated issue raised by Brabant appraisal. Two issues under state law; addressed AB 2782 and Government Code Section 65863.7; spoke about adequate housing. The City Council had discretion to come up with other benefits.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani stated issue by Thomas Casparian allegations regarding another variance; city never commenced park closure. She asked if Assistant City Attorney Benjamin Jones has anything to address that she may have missed. Assistant City Attorney Benjamin Jones stated that City Attorney Soltani covered everything and thanked her.

Director Naaseh noted the direct phone number for Executive Assistant Sylvia Rubio is (310) 952-1700, extension 1318 for assistance in Spanish.

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton asked for a dedicated line for the residents' questions to be answered; inquired if provided to residents in Spanish; 30-year mark; were these coach owners who rented their homes to people and told them that they would

be there for 30 years or was it the park owner who is asking the questions.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes inquired if the park manager who provided the information.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani stated Thomas Casparian tried to address the issue and he said it may have been the park owner trying to get an extension from the city. She reviewed the record and Thomas Casparian was correct that there has been notice given to the residents at the time they were buying their coaches in writing. If the residents were verbally presented to them that there is going to be an extension and residents relied on it. If you look at the purchase since the residents paid for their coaches compared to some of the other mobilehome parks in the city, the purchase price they paid is reflective because they were lower purchase prices they paid. It is reflective of the fact that they must have been on notice that the park is going to close. That is the point the City Council should focus on. If the residents had paid \$150,000 for their coach because the park owner was misrepresenting to them that the park was going to remain open, that would be a fraudulent activity. The purchase price would have been so outrageous that the City Council should look at how to address it. But if you look at the record, even if the park owner was verbally misrepresenting that the park is going to remain open, the purchase price that the residents were paying as shown in the appraisal was reflective of the fact that the park was probably going to close.

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton stated to differentiate that one person said that Mr. Brabant did their appraisal and received another appraisal from an outside appraiser. He inquired what makes Brabant valid and relevant and his numbers being from the estimation that they said were between \$150,000 so his estimation being almost \$123,000 off. He asked the City Attorney to explain because people were saying that their house is worth more than \$28,000 and do not want the City Council to go down the path to say that they are not concerned about the citizens when they are.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani stated that it is another point to address. Brabant appraiser indicated that the zoning compliance was legal but it is not which we know. The appraiser's assumption was inaccurate. Also, instead of looking at all the sales that took place within the park, there is plenty of sales that took place within the park he ignored all of that and he relied on four comparable sales. Out of the ten appraisals that he conducted and all of those four comparable came from Colony Cove and Carson Harbor Village which are the two top notch parks in the City of Carson. The appraisal was not done properly. Mr. Brabant has relied on comparable sales and sales that have taken place within the park. The residents are raising the fact that the park owner has been buying the coaches but as presented Mr. Brabant's rebuttal, he had ten sales that were between residents where the park owner is not involved and those sales all were within the same range as to what the park owner paid. If you exclude the park owner's sales and you only look at the sales that happen resident to resident, a willing knowing buyer paid \$18,000 on the average for the coaches to a willing knowing seller. You cannot ignore under appraisal laws or rules. You cannot ignore the zoning, the legal non-conforming status of the park. The appraiser who has done the appraisals on behalf of the residents is just basically saying that the zoning is legal and compliant because if he had looked at the true zoning he would have had a different result.

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Bod Member Hilton stated the attorney Ana Zuniga referred to AB 2782 just passed and how they were not in line with that. He asked if City Attorney Soltani can speak to that if closure is in line with that or not.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani stated very complex issues dealing with. Yes, AB 2782 requires mobilehome park appraisals to be based on the current in place value of the mobilehome and shall assume that the park closure is not happening. The legislative history of AB 2782 is that the legislature wanted to avoid off site value. They wanted to clarify that a park and appraiser cannot say the park closure application is pending therefore because the park closure application is pending now all the prices are lower so I'm going to appraise the coaches at low values. That was the purpose of AB 2782. In this situation, Mr. Brabant is not looking at the park closure to say that the values are impacted. He is looking at the zoning not being legal conforming and under appraisal rules, an appraiser is required to look at zoning. You cannot ignore zoning and if there is a legal non-conforming zoning you cannot just disregard that. I understand it creates confusion in this situation because this is a very unique circumstance. It is an exceptional circumstance we are dealing with because you have a park where coach values for decades have been impacted because of the legal non-conforming use of the park and in valuing that the appraiser has taken into consideration that impact. But because there is a pending park closure application, it can get confusing and somebody can think well this is because of the park closure application. It is not because even if the park closure application was not happening without the park closure application, what these coaches are selling on the open market is what the appraiser relied on. It is the \$18,000 exchanges that are happening but yet your appraiser Mr. Brabant evaluation is at average of \$28,000 per coach so it is even higher than what has been happening on the open market.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes referred to page 111 of the report which has each coach and value, off site and on site.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani stated the Planning Commission also imposed a condition. There are a couple of outliers that for some reason those residents paid substantially more than what other residents have been paying for those coaches. One was at \$63,000. Even those residents are going to be made whole because the Planning Commission condition said if a resident paid more for their coach than the appraised value, then the resident shall get the purchase price. The Planning Commission tried to address the residents who may have paid more for their coaches than the fair market value.

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks stated some residents owe \$40,000 or \$50,000 on their coach so if doing \$28,000 his concern is what will happen with the balance that is owed on the coaches if they are only valued at \$28,000 but in the same breath they are going to be made whole based upon the purchase price. City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani responded in the affirmative.

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks stated but in the event he bought his coach at \$23,000 and received a loan because it was valued more than that when I received a loan offer. What is going to happen to the loan if I have other obligations on the property?

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani stated if the residents have a loan that is higher than their purchase price and the fair market value, they should bring that to the city and contact Spanish speaking staff and if English speaking they can contact Director Naaseh and can look at the individual circumstances and see if there is a remedy that can be thought of and presented to the park owner and a solution from the city for the residents. The City Council has discretion to make sure to mitigate the adverse impacts of the park closure. If there is a loan that was taken out that would hinder the resident from receiving the fair market value of their coach to be able to find other housing when they get displaced, there has to be something that the city can do about that. The City Council can consider imposing additional conditions/benefits to try to mitigate the impacts further on the residents.

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks noted concern that it was stated by Thomas Casparian in his testimony regarding the notification to the individuals living in the mobilehome park; you had people who moved in 2009 and in 2012. Clearly, they were informed of any closure to some degree because something was told to them separate and was told about a \$30,000 extension that was given and feels there has not been clear information given to the residents and individuals were trying to at least circumvent the process by extending the rental agreement so they can continue to receive funds. If going to abide by the new law that became effective January 1, 2021 that we need to put a really good package together to support the residents and ensure they are made whole.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes stated to look at the medium; coaches need to be addressed individually; concur with Council Member Hicks with a resident who has a loan on their home and bought at a higher price; likes Assistant City Attorney Benjamin Jones' tiered approach but seemed to lump everyone together and gave the same.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani stated the appraisal looked at each coach separately; each coach has a separate fair market value.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani stated the City Council can consider imposing a condition of approval that any resident who has a unique situation of having a mortgage or loan that exceeds the fair market value or the purchase price of their coach can submit that evidence to the city. Also, can ask the City Council to allow us to think of a fair approach to deal with that and try to reach an understanding with the park owner. If cannot do that for the limited purpose of only those individuals if can reach an understanding with the park owner will bring those limited units back to the City Council. Do not want to make a decision about those few individuals on the spot right now; the situations should have been presented to the staff earlier and residents have addressed this evening and the City Council's desire to help the individuals but need to understand the facts and circumstances better to come up with a fair approach to addressing the situation.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes stated do not piece mail; approach all in one.

Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear stated the information appears contradictory; Thomas Casparian not presenting accurately and correctly. He asked City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani to explain AB 2782; not in favor of park closing and is being done because of an economic decision for themselves; even if the park goes through the



process of closure, it will not be closed for at least two years from now and with the COVID-19 pandemic still in existence, residents need an opportunity to relocate. He asked City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani to outline AB 2782 and how it would affect the park; agree to not have a cookie cutter approach of one size fits all.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani stated the Planning Commission imposed a one year timeline and the City Council can increase timeline to two years to mitigate the negative impacts of the park closure in the midst of COVID-19 on the residents which would be a fair additional condition if the City Council would like to impose that; outlined AB 2782 which is the subdivision she read into the record earlier with greater discretion to address the issue; timeline; negative impacts; can impose condition; discretion of AB 2782; mitigation.

She stated that she and Assistant City Attorney Benjamin Jones are deliberating what could be an approach that addresses the request to not have a cookie cutter approach. The Planning Commission gave each resident an additional one year of rent subsidies. She explained the rent subsidies; perhaps a tiered approach to providing rent subsidies to mitigate impact of the park closure. She and staff can come back with an approach.

Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear stated he likes the tiered approach; case by case.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes stated to address individual needs.

Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear recommended to bring item back in two weeks and requested to make sure not to put residents on the street and make sure they are able to live for two or three years if park closes that they have rent subsidies they need to survive; do not like rushing to make decisions affecting 81 units. The City Council needs to come up with the best package and requested to discuss with each resident to explain.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani stated if the City Council is inclined to continue the meeting, she can work with staff and talk to experts in the field to find out what would be sufficient rent subsidies to make sure that we sufficiently mitigate the impacts. Meanwhile Interpreter Diane can inform the Spanish speaking residents anyone who has the mortgage situation will need to have the information as soon as possible to allow time to prepare proposal for the City Council at the next meeting.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes requested staff to come back with actual recommendations.

Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear suggested to hold a special City Council meeting.

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks recommended staff come up with an Option C.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes requested an extension for City Council. She asked Director Naaseh if on a time constraint.

Director Naaseh requested to continue the item to a date certain.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes suggested the special meeting be held outside of regular meeting before June 15, 2021.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes stated she is good for Wednesday, June 16, 2021, at 5:00 P.M. with Council Members in consensus.

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Bod Member Hilton stated subsidies to be in a lump sum.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani stated to continue the Public Hearing to June 16, 2021, at 5:00 P.M.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes reopened the Public Hearing at 10:19 P.M.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes requested that the Public Hearing be continued to Wednesday, June 16, 2021, at 5:00 P.M.

Director Naaseh asked if same set up from this evening for the Community Center or Zoom meeting and would share the link.

Mayor and City Council were in consensus of the same set up for the next meeting.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes requested to allow other speakers to speak.

Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear requested staff to verify the speakers' comments regarding amounts.

- Recommendation:
1. OPEN the public hearing.
  2. TAKE public testimony.
  3. CLOSE the public hearing.
  4. ADOPT Resolution No. 21-070, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF CARSON, CALIFORNIA, MODIFYING, PURSUANT TO CARSON MUNICIPAL CODE SECTION 9173.4(C)(2)(b), THE DECISION OF THE CARSON PLANNING COMMISSION ADOPTING PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 21-2708 CONDITIONALLY APPROVING RELOCATION IMPACT REPORT NO. 04-19 FOR MITIGATION OF RELOCATION IMPACTS OF CLOSURE OF RANCHO DOMINGUEZ MOBILE ESTATES, BY IMPOSING ADDITIONAL RELOCATION IMPACT MITIGATION MEASURES AND ALTERING THE PROOF OF PURCHASE PRICE REQUIREMENTS, AND AFFIRMING THE DECISION IN ALL OTHER RESPECTS (Exhibit No. 13).

**ACTION:** Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes continued the Public Hearing to a City Council Special Meeting on June 16, 2021, at 5:00 P.M. to be held via Zoom, with no objection heard and staff to provide an all-inclusive type package.

Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear stated staff to take in consideration to where residents are moving to.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes recommended to use same approach as the Imperial Avalon Mobilehome Park closure.

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton stated the subsidy paid in lump sum; find alternate appraiser other than Brabant for comparison.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani stated for the record that Mr. Brabant is one of the most reputable/credible mobile home park appraisers in the state and will try to see what can be done.

Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear stated Mr. Brabant does not enter the house.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani stated that Mr. Brabant enters to appraise and tried to contact residents with no response. The park owner sent letters to the residents and they were non responsive to Mr. Brabant.

Assistant City/Agency/Authority Attorney Benjamin Jones stated half of the residents responded to the questionnaires; Mr. Brabant did not enter homes due to COVID and tried other means; it should be noted there is a condition of approval, however, that says if there is any error in the appraisal based on not taking into account some improvement or modification that was made to a mobile home, there is a process for residents to apply for a modified and adjusted appraisal using the same methodology but taking into account those factors and adjusting the appraised value accordingly. He discussed the Brabant appraisals.

Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear stated those factors should be taken into account and do not know why the park owner would not cooperate; some people spoke tonight who indicated that they made improvements in their home and that falls under the category Assistant City/Agency/Authority Attorney Benjamin Jones described and those individuals should be contacted by staff.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes requested to extend the meeting past 11:30 P.M. with no objection heard.

**RECESS:**

The meeting was recessed at 10:29 P.M. by Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes for a break.

**RECONVENE:**

The meeting was reconvened at 10:41 P.M. by Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes with all members previously noted present.

**DISCUSSION: (Items 17-20)**

**Item No. 17. 2021-411 COVID-19 UPDATE (CITY COUNCIL)**

Assistant City Manager Roberts gave a PowerPoint presentation on COVID-19 Update: Upcoming Vaccination Events and Vax for Win.

Recommendation: DISCUSS and PROVIDE any further direction.

ACTION: Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes ordered this item received and filed with no objection heard.

**Item No. 18. 2021-438 CONSIDER A RESOLUTION RATIFYING IN PART AND AMENDING IN PART, THE CARSON DISASTER COUNCIL ORDER DATED MAY 27, 2021, AND CITY COUNCIL ORDINANCE, TO ALIGN THE CITY OF CARSON MASK MANDATES WITH THOSE OF THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES AND STATE OF CALIFORNIA (CITY COUNCIL)**

City Manager Landers gave a report.

Recommendation: 1. APPROVE Resolution No. 21-071, "A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF CARSON, CALIFORNIA, RATIFYING, CONFIRMING AND AMENDING THAT CERTAIN ORDER ENTITLED 'AN ORDER OF THE CARSON DISASTER COUNCIL, CITY OF CARSON, CALIFORNIA, IMPLEMENTING MUNICIPAL CODE, ARTICLE III, CHAPTER 7, SECTION 3700 ET SEQ., FINDING, DETERMINING AND ORDERING THAT ALL RESIDENTS OR VISITORS WITHIN THE GEOGRAPHIC BOUNDARIES OF THE CITY OF CARSON SHALL ABIDE BY STATE OF CALIFORNIA AND/OR COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES FACE MASKS OR COVERINGS MANDATES,' ISSUED MAY 27, 2021"

2. INTRODUCE and READ by title only, with further reading waived, Ordinance No. 21-2115, "AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF CARSON, CALIFORNIA, AMENDING SECTION 3708.1 (FACE MASKS AND COVERINGS RELATED TO COVID-19) OF CHAPTER 7 (EMERGENCY ORGANIZATION) OF ARTICLE III (PUBLIC SAFETY) OF THE CARSON MUNICIPAL CODE REGARDING MANDATING FACE MASKS AND COVERINGS WITHIN CITY OF CARSON GEOGRAPHICAL BOUNDARIES DURING COVID-19 EMERGENCY PERIOD"

ACTION: It was moved to approve staff recommendations on motion of Dear, seconded by Hicks and unanimously carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes, Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear, Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton, and Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks  
Noes: None  
Abstain: None  
Absent: None

**Item No. 19. 2021-416 CONSIDER A CONTINUED DISCUSSION OF FILLING THE CITY CLERK VACANCY (CITY COUNCIL)**

Item No. 19 was heard after approval of the Consent items.

City Manager Landers gave a report.

Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear reported the City Clerk Vacancy Ad Hoc Committee consisting of himself and Mayor Davis-Holmes met and discussed options.

Recommendation: 1. DISCUSS and PROVIDE direction for filling the vacancy created by Donesia Gause-Aldana's resignation from the City Clerk position.  
2. DISCUSS and PROVIDE direction on beginning the process to amend the City Charter to allow the City Clerk and City Treasurer positions to be filled by appointment on a permanent basis.

ACTION: It was moved to direct staff to bring back a resolution to call for a special election on November 2, 2021 to fill the vacancy of the City Clerk position on motion of Dear, seconded by Hilton.

During discussion of the motion, Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes stated that she would bring back recommendations from the City Clerk Vacancy Ad Hoc Committee at a future date.

The motion was unanimously carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes, Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear, Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton, and Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks  
Noes: None  
Abstain: None  
Absent: None

**Item No. 20. 2021-420 CONSIDERATION OF LOCAL APPOINTMENTS TO THE CITY'S COMMISSIONS, COMMITTEES AND BOARDS; AND/OR CITY COUNCIL SUB-COMMITTEES; AND/OR CITY-AFFILIATED ORGANIZATIONS BY MAYOR AND CITY**

## COUNCIL (CITY COUNCIL)

Item No. 20 was heard after Item No. 18.

Recommendation:

TAKE the following actions:

1. CONSIDER and APPOINT, REAPPOINT or REMOVE members to the Commissions, Committees and Boards; and/or
2. REAFFIRM, RE-DESIGNATE and/or DESIGNATE member assignments to the City Council Sub-Committees; and/or
3. REAFFIRM, RE-DESIGNATE and/or DESIGNATE delegates and alternates to the City-Affiliated Organizations; and
4. DIRECT the City Clerk to notify all affected appointments, reappointments or removed members and/or all affected City-Affiliated Organizations of this action in writing;
5. IF APPLICABLE, DIRECT the City Clerk to post and publish in accordance with the Maddy Act.

ACTION: Mayor and City Council took the following actions:

### Human Relations Commission

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes appointed the following individuals to the Human Relations Commission:

Kelvin Brown  
Chike Nweke  
Jessica Ramos  
Dr. Chinyere Ifeacho, Alternate 1  
Irene Vineres, Alternate 2  
Federico Olaes, Alternate 3

### Youth Commission

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes appointed the following individuals to the Youth Commission:

GP Atkins  
Kari Lane

### Human Relations Commission

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton appointed Kimberly Davenport to the Human Relations Commission.

Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear appointed Tina Keely to the Human Relations Commission.

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks appointed Cassandra Reed to the Human Relations Commission.

Parks and Recreation Commission

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes appointed the following individuals to the Parks and Recreation Commission:

Jo Jackie Johnson, Alternate 2  
Clarence Dunning, Alternate 3

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks appointed Alex Cainglet to the Parks and Recreation Commission.

Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear appointed Kisa Fulbright to the Parks and Recreation Commission.

**ACTION:** It was moved to ratify the Mayor's appointments on the Human Relations Commission and the Parks and Recreation Commission on motion of Davis-Holmes, seconded by Dear and unanimously carried by the following vote:

**Ayes:** Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes, Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear, Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton, and Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks  
**Noes:** None  
**Abstain:** None  
**Absent:** None

Planning Commission

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes appointed the following individuals to the Planning Commission:

Fred Docdocil, Alternate 1  
Richard Hernandez, Alternate 2  
Lina Philipps, Alternate 3

**ACTION:** It was moved to ratify the Mayor's appointments on the Planning Commission on motion of Davis-Holmes, seconded by Hicks and unanimously carried by the following vote:

**Ayes:** Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes, Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear, Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton, and Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks  
**Noes:** None  
**Abstain:** None  
**Absent:** None

Public Relations Commission

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes appointed the following individuals to the Public Relations Commission:

Freddie Gomez  
Linda Steward  
Pam Pitcher  
Sonya Eatmon  
Kate Nunley  
Rochelle Guillory, Alternate 1  
Dorcas Waddis, Alternate 2  
Dr. Denice Price, Alternate 3

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks appointed Jackie Stewart to the Public Relations Commission.

ACTION: It was moved to ratify the Mayor's appointments on the Public Relations Commission on motion of Davis-Holmes, seconded by Dear and unanimously carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes, Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear, Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton, and Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks  
Noes: None  
Abstain: None  
Absent: None

Public Safety Commission

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes appointed the following individuals to the Public Safety Commission:

Sam Dacus  
Jeff Allen  
Heidi Romero  
Angela Reyes  
Keith Arnold  
Andre Clancy, Alternate 1  
Louis Cogut, Alternate 2  
Aisha Childs, Alternate 3

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton appointed Pastor Prentice Lewis to the Public Safety Commission.



Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks appointed Donny Dorsey to the Public Safety Commission.

**ACTION:** It was moved to ratify the Mayor's appointments on the Public Safety Commission on motion of Davis-Holmes, seconded by Dear and unanimously carried by the following vote:

**Ayes:** Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes, Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear, Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton, and Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks

**Noes:** None

**Abstain:** None

**Absent:** None

### Public Works Commission

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes appointed the following individuals to the Public Works Commission:

Kobii Howard

Sandy Hamilton, Alternate 1

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks appointed James Murphy to the Public Works Commission.

**ACTION:** It was moved to ratify the Mayor's appointments on the Public Works Commission on motion of Davis-Holmes, seconded by Hicks and unanimously carried by the following vote:

**Ayes:** Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes, Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear, Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton, and Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks

**Noes:** None

**Abstain:** None

**Absent:** None

### Parks and Recreation Commission

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes appointed Kim Cortado as regular member to the Parks and Recreation Commission for Council Member Hilton, thereby, created a vacancy of the Alternate 1 position on the Parks and Recreation Commission.

### Senior Citizens Advisory Commission

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes appointed the following individuals to the Senior Citizens Advisory Commission:

Maria Pilapil  
Darlene Lott  
Angelina Macias  
Estrella Bumacod  
Shirley Graves  
Itelia Walker  
Rosemary Becerril  
Patricia Patterson, Alternate 1  
Billy Bates, Alternate 2  
Delia Lopez, Alternate 3

Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear appointed Myrna Ronquillo to the Senior Citizens Advisory Commission.

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks appointed Julie Ruiz-Raber to the Senior Citizens Advisory Commission.

**ACTION:** It was moved to ratify the Mayor's appointments on the Senior Citizens Advisory Commission on motion of Davis-Holmes, seconded by Dear and unanimously carried by the following vote:

**Ayes:** Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes, Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear, Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton, and Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks  
**Noes:** None  
**Abstain:** None  
**Absent:** None

Veterans Affairs Commission

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes appointed the following individuals to the Veterans Affairs Commission:

Roger Branch  
Janel Watt  
Demitrios Vandiegriff  
Emmanuel Solomon  
Manuel Da Silva  
Thomas Woods  
Richard Woods

Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear appointed Robert Boyd to the Veterans Affairs Commission.

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks appointed Brian Raber to the Veterans Affairs Commission.

ACTION: It was moved to ratify the Mayor's appointments on the Veterans Affairs Commission on motion of Davis-Holmes, seconded by Dear and unanimously carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes, Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear, Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton, and Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks  
Noes: None  
Abstain: None  
Absent: None

Women's Issues Commission

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes appointed the following individuals to the Women's Issues Commission:

Dr. Lee Fields Robinson Cohen  
Dr. Lorie Matthews  
Carolyn Foster  
Connie Manio  
Sheila Tresvant  
Dr. Greta Price, Alternate 1  
Lilibeth Lustina, Alternate 2  
Queen Jones, Alternate 3

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton appointed Susan Houze to the Women's Issues Commission.

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks appointed Precious Robinson to the Women's Issues Commission.

ACTION: It was moved to ratify the Mayor's appointments on the Women's Issues Commission on motion of Davis-Holmes, seconded by Dear and unanimously carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes, Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear, Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton, and Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks  
Noes: None  
Abstain: None  
Absent: None

Youth Commission

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes appointed the following individuals to the Youth Commission:

Juliana Castillo  
John Taishay White  
Mariah Guzman  
Eva Caiole  
Justine Moore  
Joshua Barboza  
Devon Hawkins  
Adam Reed, Alternate 1  
Jordan Macias, Alternate 2  
Felicia Jordan, Alternate 3

**ACTION:** It was moved to ratify the Mayor's appointments on the Youth Commission on motion of Davis-Holmes, seconded by Dear and unanimously carried by the following vote:

**Ayes:** Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes, Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear, Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton, and Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks  
**Noes:** None  
**Abstain:** None  
**Absent:** None

Measure C and Measure K Budget Oversight Committee

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes appointed the following individuals to the Measure C and Measure K Budget Oversight Committee:

Cynthia Hunter  
Silvia Cruz, Alternate 1  
Irene Viernes, Alternate 2

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks appointed Vera Dorsey Reeves to the Measure C and Measure K Budget Oversight Committee.

**ACTION:** It was moved to ratify the Mayor's appointments on the Measure C and Measure K Budget Oversight Committee on motion of Davis-Holmes, seconded by Dear and unanimously carried by the following vote:

**Ayes:** Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes, Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear, Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton, and Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks  
**Noes:** None  
**Abstain:** None  
**Absent:** None

Mobilehome Park Rental Review Board

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes appointed Phyllis Hayes as At-Large Member to the Mobilehome Park Rental Review Board.

ACTION: It was moved to ratify the Mayor’s appointment on the Mobilehome Park Rental Review Board on motion of Davis-Holmes, seconded by Dear and unanimously carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes, Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear, Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton, and Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks

Noes: None

Abstain: None

Absent: None

Relocation Appeals Board

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes requested staff to verify the number of members on the Relocation Appeals Board.

General Plan Advisory Committee

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes appointed the following individuals to the General Plan Advisory Committee:

- Lula Davis-Holmes  
Representative from the Carson Sheriff Department
- Charlotte Brimmer
- Lisa Fulbright, Alternate 1
- Aminika Lott, Alternate 2

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks appointed Monica Dudley Kimball to the General Plan Advisory Committee.

Community Development/Housing/Logistics & Transit Standing Committee

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes appointed herself and Mayor Pro Tem Dear to the Community Development/Housing/Logistics & Transit Standing Committee with no objection heard.

Dignity Health Sports Park/CSUDH/Community Center Standing Committee

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes appointed Council Member Hicks and Council Member Hilton to the Dignity Health Sports Park/CSUDH/Community Center Standing Committee with no objection heard.

**ACTION:** It was moved to ratify the Mayor's appointments to the Community Development/Housing/Logistics & Transit Standing Committee and the Dignity Health Sports Park/CSUDH/Community Center Standing Committee on motion of Dear, seconded by Hilton and unanimously carried by the following vote:

**Ayes:** Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes, Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear, Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton, and Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks  
**Noes:** None  
**Abstain:** None  
**Absent:** None

**ORDINANCE SECOND READING: (Item 21)**

**Item No. 21. 2021-367 ORDINANCE NO. 21-2114: ADOPTION OF AN ORDINANCE AMENDING SECTION 3101.10 9 VIOLATIONS OF FIREWORKS REGULATIONS OF CHAPTER 1 (FIRE PREVENTION) OF ARTICLE III (PUBLIC SAFETY) OF THE CARSON MUNICIPAL CODE TO PROVIDE THAT SPECIFIED FINE AMOUNTS BE VARIED BY RESOLUTION (CITY COUNCIL)**

Item No. 21 was heard after Item No. 19.

Assistant City Manager Roberts gave an updated report.

**Recommendation:** CONDUCT a Second Reading by title only and with further reading waived, and ADOPT Ordinance No. 21-2114 "AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF CARSON, CALIFORNIA, AMENDING SECTION 3101.10 (VIOLATIONS OF FIREWORKS REGULATIONS) OF CHAPTER 1 (FIRE PREVENTION) OF ARTICLE III (PUBLIC SAFETY) OF THE CARSON MUNICIPAL CODE TO PROVIDE THAT SPECIFIED FINE AMOUNTS MAY BE VARIED BY RESOLUTION"

**ACTION:** It was moved to waive further reading and adopt Ordinance No. 21-2114, as read by title only, on motion of Dear, seconded by Hicks and unanimously carried by the following vote:

**Ayes:** Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes, Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear, Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton, and Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks  
**Noes:** None  
**Abstain:** None  
**Absent:** None

## MEMORIAL ADJOURNMENTS

This item was heard after Item No. 20.

Deputy City Clerk/Deputy Agency Secretary/Deputy Authority Secretary Simarago presented the following Memorial Adjournment Requests:

Morris Casey, Jr.  
Thelma Harris  
Marie Colotario  
Robert Mitchell  
Earl Jones

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes requested to add Earl Holmes to the Memorial Adjournment Requests.

## ORAL COMMUNICATIONS FOR MATTERS NOT LISTED ON THE AGENDA (MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC)

This item was heard after Item No. 6.

Deputy City Clerk/Deputy Agency Secretary/Deputy Authority Secretary Simarago presented the following public comments that were submitted electronically:

### Rick Pulido – Non Agenda Item

Offered comments regarding beautification projects, tree planting, street repairs, tree trimming, capital improvement projects, city events, and City Clerk vacancy.

### Liz Foisia – Non Agenda Item

Opposed to the Mayor's remarks regarding Oral Communications at the City Council meeting held on May 18, 2021.

### City/Agency/Authority Treasurer Monica Cooper

Requested to address an issue regarding the possible misuse of city and taxpayer funds

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani stated if City Treasurer Cooper wishes City Council to take action that it would have to be agendized at a future meeting.

The following individuals submitted an electronic comment on non-agendized items:

### Peo – Non Agenda Item

Offered comments regarding racial tension and discrimination in the city

### Loren Miles, Trustee, HEG Trust – Non Agenda Item

Offered comments regarding access to property recently acquired by the City of Carson - 18620 S. Broadway, Carson, CA 90248 to conduct a ground water investigation (CPT)

## COUNCIL MEMBER REQUESTS TO ADD ITEMS TO FUTURE AGENDAS – None.

## **ORAL COMMUNICATIONS (COUNCIL MEMBERS)**

Mayor Pro Tem/Agency Vice Chairman/Authority Vice Chairman Dear stated he is glad that the June 15, 2021 date is coming around for opening up the State.

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hilton announced Chick-Fil-A would like to hire 200 people from Carson; to apply text the word "thrive" to 310-340-0764; paying a livable wage, not minimum wage.

Council Member/Agency Member/Authority Board Member Hicks congratulated his daughter for obtaining her Masters Degree from California State University Long Beach which can go along with her job as a Social Worker for the Los Angeles County.

Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes stated she is glad to see City Attorney Soltani and her prayers are with her during this time for her mother's recovery.

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani thanked the Mayor and City Council for their thoughts and prayers.

## **ANNOUNCEMENT OF UNFINISHED OR CONTINUED CLOSED SESSION ITEMS (AS NECESSARY)**

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani announced the Closed Session items earlier in the meeting.

## **RECESS INTO CLOSED SESSION**

The meeting was recessed at 11:16 P.M. by Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes to Closed Session.

## **RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION**

The meeting was reconvened at 11:39 P.M. by Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes with all members previously noted present.

## **REPORT OF ACTIONS ON UNFINISHED OR CONTINUED CLOSED SESSION ITEMS (CITY ATTORNEY)**

City/Agency/Authority Attorney Soltani provided the Closed Session report as follows:

### Closed Session Item No. 2

No reportable action was taken in the other case.

### Closed Session Item No. 3

No reportable action was taken.



**ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned at 11:41 P.M. by Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman Davis-Holmes.

---

Lula Davis-Holmes  
Mayor/Agency Chairman/Authority Chairman

ATTEST:

---

Joy Simarago  
Deputy City Clerk/Deputy Agency Secretary/  
Deputy Authority Secretary

APPROVED BY CARSON  
CITY COUNCIL/SUCCESSOR AGENCY/  
HOUSING AUTHORITY

04-16-2024

Approved as Submitted CH/JH 4/0/0/1-LDH